

Neoliberal Ebola

Robert G. Wallace • Rodrick Wallace
Editors

Neoliberal Ebola

Modeling Disease Emergence from Finance
to Forest and Farm

 Springer

Editors

Robert G. Wallace
Institute for Global Studies
University of Minnesota
MN, USA

Rodrick Wallace
New York State Psychiatric Institute
at Columbia University
Division of Epidemiology
NY, USA

ISBN 978-3-319-40939-9

ISBN 978-3-319-40940-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-40940-5

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016947954

© Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2016

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG Switzerland

Preface

Disease outbreaks are as much markers of as they are threats to modern civilization. What successfully evolves and spreads depends on the matrix of barriers and opportunities a given society presents its circulating pathogens (FAO 2013; Engering et al. 2013; R.G. Wallace et al. 2015).

For most of its history, *Vibrio cholerae* predated upon plankton in the Ganges delta (Johnson 2006). Only once humanity switched to urban sedentism and later by nineteenth century trade and transport became increasingly integrated in geography and economy did the cholera bacterium evolve an explosive human-specific ecotype.

Simian immunodeficiency viruses, spilling over for centuries, emerged out of their nonhuman *Catarrhini* reservoirs as HIV only when colonial expropriation turned subsistence bushmeat and the urban sex trade into commodities of industrial scale (Wallace 2010; Pepin 2011; Timberg and Halpern 2013).

Domesticated stock served as sources for human diphtheria, influenza, measles, mumps, plague, pertussis, rotavirus A, tuberculosis, sleeping sickness, and visceral leishmaniasis (McNeill 1977/2010; Wolfe et al. 2007). Ecological changes brought upon landscapes by human intervention selected for spillovers of malaria from birds and dengue fever, malaria, and yellow fever from wild primates.

The new pathogens selected for improvements in medical technologies and public health (Watts 1997, Colgrove 2002). In turn, a daisy chain of innovation in agricultural and industrial methods, accelerating demographic shifts and new settlement, rejuxtaposed potential host populations, promoting new rounds of spillover (Kock et al. 2012; R.G. Wallace et al. 2015).

Presently, humanity's organizing ethos orbits neoliberal capitalism, even in opposition (Plehwe et al. 2006). Neoliberalism is a program of political economy aimed at globalizing laissez-faire economics for multinationals, promoting free trade, and shifting state expenditures in favor of protecting private property and deregulating economic markets (Harvey 2005, Centeno and Cohen 2012, Ganti 2014). Once applied at a particular locale, the doctrine has considerable impact on local landscapes and functional ecosystems alike, with decisive effect upon the

fortunes of infectious disease (Maye et al. 2012; R.G. Wallace and Kock 2012; Jones et al. 2013; Maye et al. 2014; Degeling et al.; Mann et al. 2015; Wiethoelter et al. 2015; R. Wallace et al. 2016).

In this volume, we present the emergence of an urbanized Ebola in West Africa in late 2013, spreading from human to human and infecting 28,000, as a quintessential example of such a neoliberal transition. Societal shifts extending from local environmental and social spaces out to global relational geographies turned what until this point had been a backwater virus into a sudden protopandemic threat.

The first paper collected here, published in fall of 2014 as the outbreak in West Africa finally captured the globe's broader attention as possibly more than a regional threat, positions the outbreak as global in origins. R.G. Wallace et al. (2014) describe the likely cascade by which multilateral structural adjustment and a multinational land rush encroached upon regional forests and truncated medical infrastructure. The resulting increases in Ebola spillover likely accelerated the emergence of a human-to-human infection. The authors hang the specific mechanism on the spread of monoculture oil palm to which Ebola-bearing species of bats are attracted and along which the latter's interface with humans likely expanded (Shafie et al. 2011).

The team pegs such epidemiological shifts, of which Ebola's urbanization appears representative, to a model of changes in environmental stochasticity (R. Wallace and R.G. Wallace 2015). The ecosystemic fluctuations across populations of a "noisy" forest typically truncate the chains of transmission on which such a virulent pathogen depends. Such noise asymptotically drives the pathogen population to local extirpation. When monoculture production is suddenly imposed upon such an agroforestry, the inherent disruption to pathogen transmission is stripped out, accelerating spillover and explosive growth across the host populations that remain.

The second paper, published here for the first time, revisits an outbreak of another Ebola, the Reston species, among industrial hog in the Philippines in 2009 and more recently in China (Barrette et al. 2009; Pan et al. 2014). The shifts in stochasticity at the heart of the first paper are extended into a more realistic travel-based formalism of spatial spread, an agroecological logic gate for epidemic control, and a more explicit connection to economic models of agricultural production by way of a variation of the Black-Scholes approach to option pricing.

The latter model shows that pathogen emergence in intensive production may outpace the margins agrifood extends to biocontrol. The financial holes that result appear largely filled only after the outbreak begins and by other stakeholders entirely. Livestock, contract farmers, public health, smallholder production, wildlife, the environment, and governments across administrative units are asked to bear the costs in health and/or finances. Should such substantial costs be returned to company ledgers, agribusiness as we know it would cease to exist. R. Wallace et al. (2016) hypothesize that as industrial livestock expands, in contrast, including across areas of Africa in which Ebola has already emerged as a human infection, multiple novel phenotypes are likely to emerge out of such an agroeconomic frame.

The third paper expands the epistemological implications of the West African outbreak, particularly within the context of what appears to be the development of an efficacious vaccine (Henao-Restrepo et al. 2015). Blips in new cases con-

tinue to intermittently reappear across the three countries most affected—Guinea, Liberia, and Sierra Leone—even as the outbreak is repeatedly declared ended (e.g., Barbarossa et al. 2015). The paper hypothesizes that the social environment driving the ecotypic shift in Ebola in the region may be strong enough to offset the epidemiological advances offered by the new vaccine and other proximate interventions (R.G. Wallace et al. 2016). Emergency and palliative responses cannot be separated from structural context. The virus, even when maneuvered back upon its proverbial heels, threatens to reemerge by virtue of causes beyond the biomedical, however important the latter.

The fourth paper, published here for the first time, applies a control theory model that prioritizes social policy and economic structure. The ecology of infectious disease emerges from more than aggregate measures of population dynamics, depending decisively upon such context.

The fifth paper, again published here first, examines mechanisms by which a deadly pandemic may become the trigger for an avalanche of socioeconomic disintegration that can carry far heavier burdens of morbidity and mortality than the disease outbreak itself.

Indeed, big picture, these papers together explore the relationships among the ostensible objects driving or dragging upon the disease—the pathogen and vaccines against, for instance—and the fields within which such objects relate. As we review here, growing banks of data at the molecular and clinical levels indicate that the Ebola strain in West Africa is little different from its forest predecessors. As causality emerges from the interaction between objects and field, a shift in regional agro-economics can engender a parallax effect in which an unchanged object expresses new properties by virtue of a shift in context alone (Zizek 2006).

In short, as humanity's epidemiological history attests, context is more than merely a veritable stage on which pathogens and immunity clash. The regional agro-economic impacts of global neoliberalism are foundational, felt across biocultural organization, down so far as virion and molecule. Exploring such connections frames what will likely be a cutting-edge science of the twenty first century (R.G. Wallace et al. 2015).

Minneapolis, MN, USA

Robert G. Wallace

References

- Barbarossa, M. V., Dénes, A., Kiss, G., Nakata, Y., Röst, G., & Vizi, Z. (2015). Transmission dynamics and final epidemic size of Ebola Virus Disease outbreaks with varying interventions. *PLoS One*, 10(7), e0131398. doi:[10.1371/journal.pone.0131398](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0131398).
- Barrette, R. W., Metwally, S. A., Rowland, J. M., Xu, L., Zaki, S. R., Nichol, S. T., et al. (2009). Discovery of swine as a host for the Reston ebolavirus. *Science*, 325(5937), 204–206. doi:[10.1126/science.1172705](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1172705).
- Colgrove, J. (2002). The McKeown thesis: A historical controversy and its enduring influence. *American Journal of Public Health*, 92, 725–729.

- Centeno, M. A., & Cohen, J. N. (2012). The arc of neoliberalism. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 38, 317–340. doi:10.1146/annurev-soc-081309-150235.
- Degeling, C., Johson, J., Kerridge, I., Wilson, A., Ward, M., Stewart, C., et al. (2015). Implementing a One Health approach to emerging infectious disease: Reflections on the sociopolitical, ethical and legal dimensions. *BMC Public Health*, 15, 1307. doi:10.1186/s12889-015-2617-1.
- Engering, A., Hogerwerf, L., & Slingenbergh, J. (2013). Pathogen host environment interplay and disease emergence. *Emerging Microbes and Infections*, 2, e5. <http://www.nature.com/emijournal/v2/n2/full/emi20135a.htm>.
- FAO (2013b). *World Livestock 2013: Changing disease landscapes*. United Nations, Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization.
- Ganti, T. (2014). Neoliberalism. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 43, 89–104. doi:10.1146/annurev-anthro-092412-155528.
- Harvey, D. (2005). *A brief history of Neoliberalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Henao-Restrepo, A., Longini, I. M., Egger, M., Dean, N. E., Edmunds, W. J., Camacho, A., et al. (2015). Efficacy and effectiveness of an rVSV-vectored vaccine expressing Ebola surface glycoprotein: Interim results from the Guinea ring vaccination cluster-randomised trial. *Lancet*. pii: S0140-6736(15)61117-5. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(15)61117-5.
- Johnson, S. (2006). *The ghost map: The story of London's most terrifying epidemic—and how it changed science, cities, and the modern world*. New York: Riverhead Books.
- Jones, B. A., Grace, D., Kock, R., Alonso, S., Rushton, J., Said, M. Y., et al. (2013). Zoonosis emergence linked to agricultural intensification and environmental change. *PNAS*, 110, 8399–8404.
- Kock, R. A., Alders, R., & Wallace, R. G. (2012). Wildlife, wild food, food security and human society. In *Animal health and biodiversity - preparing for the future. Illustrating contributions to public health* (pp. 71e79). Compendium of the OIE Global Conference on Wildlife, 23–25 February 2011, Paris.
- Mann, E., Streng, S., Bergeron, J., & Kicher, A. (2015). A review of the role of food and the food system in the transmission and spread of Ebolavirus. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases*, 9, e0004160. doi:10.1371/journal.pntd.0004160.
- Maye, D., Dibden, J., Higgins, V., & Potter, C. (2012). Governing biosecurity in a neoliberal world: Comparative perspectives from Australia and the United Kingdom. *Environment and Planning A*, 44, 150–168.
- Maye, D., Enticott, G., Naylor, R., Ilbery, B., & Kirwan, J. (2014). Animal disease and narratives of nature: Farmers' reactions to the neoliberal governance of bovine Tuberculosis. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 36, 401–410.
- McNeill, W. H. (1977/2010). *Plagues and peoples*. New York: Anchor Books.
- Pan, Y., Zhang, W., Cui, L., Hua, X., Wang, M., & Zeng, Q. (2014). Reston virus in domestic pigs in China. *Archives of Virology*, 159(5), 1129–1132. doi:10.1007/s00705-012-1477-6. Epub 2012 Sep 21.
- Pepin, J. (2011). *The origins of AIDS*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Plehwe, D., Walpen, B., & Neunhöffer, G. (Eds.). (2006). *Neoliberal hegemony: A global critique*. New York: Routledge.
- Shafie, N. J., Sah, S. A. M., Latip, N. S. A., Azman, N. M., & Khairuddin, N. L. (2011). Diversity pattern of bats at two contrasting habitat types along Kerian River, Perak, Malaysia. *Tropical Life Sciences Research*, 22(2), 13–22.
- Timberg, C., & Halpern, D. (2013). *Tinderbox: How the West Sparked the AIDS Epidemic and How the World Can Finally Overcome It*. New York: Penguin Press.
- Wallace, R. G. (2010). King Leopold's pandemic. *Farming pathogens*. Available online at <https://farmingpathogens.wordpress.com/2010/03/02/king-leopolds-pandemic/>
- Wallace, R., Bergmann, L., Hogerwerf, L., Kock, R., & Wallace, R. G. (2016, this volume). Ebola in the hog sector: Modeling pandemic emergence in commodity livestock.
- Wallace, R., & Wallace, R. G. (2015). Blowback: New formal perspectives on agriculturally driven pathogen evolution and spread. *Epidemiology and Infection*, 143(10), 2068–2080.

- Wallace, R. G., Bergmann, L., Kock, R., Gilbert, M., Hogerwerf, L., Wallace, R., et al. (2015). The dawn of structural one health: A new science tracking disease emergence along circuits of capital. *Social Science & Medicine*, *129*, 68–77.
- Wallace, R. G., & Kock, R. A. (2012). Whose food footprint? Capitalism, agriculture and the environment. *Human Geography*, *5*(1), 63–83.
- Wallace, R. G., Kock, R., Bergmann, L., Gilbert, M., Hogerwerf, L., Pittiglio, C., et al. (2016). Did neoliberalizing West African forests produce a new niche for Ebola? *International Journal of Health Services*, *46*, 149–165.
- Wallace, R. G., Gilbert, M., Wallace, R., Pittiglio, C., Mattioli, R., & Kock, R. (2014). Did Ebola emerge in West Africa by a policy-driven phase change in agroecology? *Environment and Planning A*, *46*(11), 2533–2542.
- Watts, S. (1997). *Epidemics and history: Disease, power, and imperialism*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Wiethoelter, A., Beltran-Alcrudo, D., Kock, R., & Mor, S. (2015). Global trends in infectious diseases at the wildlife-livestock interface. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, *112*, 9962–9967.
- Wolfe, N. D., Dunavan, C. P., & Diamond, J. (2007). Origins of major human infectious diseases. *Nature*, *447*, 279–283.
- Zizek, S. (2006). *The parallax view*. Cambridge, MA: MIT.

Contents

1 Did Ebola Emerge in West Africa by a Policy-Driven Phase Change in Agroecology?	1
Robert G. Wallace, Marius Gilbert, Rodrick Wallace, Claudia Pittiglio, Raffaele Mattioli, and Richard Kock	
2 Ebola in the Hog Sector: Modeling Pandemic Emergence in Commodity Livestock	13
Rodrick Wallace, Luke Bergmann, Lenny Hogerwerf, Richard Kock, and Robert G. Wallace	
3 Did Neoliberalizing West Africa’s Forests Produce a Vaccine-Resistant Ebola?	55
Robert G. Wallace, Richard Kock, Luke Bergmann, Marius Gilbert, Lenny Hogerwerf, Claudia Pittiglio, Raffaele Mattioli, and Rodrick Wallace	
4 Introducing Pandemic Control Theory	69
Rodrick Wallace and Robert G. Wallace	
5 The Social Amplification of Pandemics and Other Disasters	81
Rodrick Wallace and Robert G. Wallace	
Index	95

About the Authors

Luke Bergmann is an assistant professor in the Department of Geography at the University of Washington, USA. Much of his research explores how globalization affects human-environment relations through several thematic focuses. These include changes in the evolution and spread of pathogens, as well as studies of shifting socio-spatial relationships between carbon, land, capital, and consumption.

Marius Gilbert is an agricultural scientist based at the Université Libre de Bruxelles in Belgium. He has a strong interest in the spatial epidemiology of infectious diseases and the ways emerging diseases are influenced by the intensification of livestock production systems. Gilbert consults with the International Livestock Research Institute and the Food and Agriculture Organization on the Gridded Livestock of the World database, a unique spatial data set describing how livestock are distributed globally and how this distribution is transformed through agricultural intensification.

Lenny Hogerwerf is an epidemiologist and disease ecologist at the Centre for Infectious Disease Control (CIb) of the National Institute for Public Health and the Environment (RIVM) of the Netherlands. She obtained her PhD on the epidemiology of Q fever in dairy goat herds in the Netherlands at the Department of Farm Animal Health of the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine of Utrecht University. She has also developed a variety of ecological models for explaining the dynamics of HPAI H5N1 and disease landscapes more generally. She has consulted for the Food and Agriculture Organization and Veterinaires Sans Frontieres Belgium.

Richard Kock is a wildlife veterinarian, researcher, and conservationist. He is the chair in wildlife health and emerging diseases at the Pathology and Pathogen Biology Department at the Royal Veterinary College in London. For over three decades, he has participated in a variety of research and management efforts in epizootology, wildlife health, and conservation in countries around the world, including across sub-Saharan Africa. His most recent projects include the eradication of rinderpest

and efforts to control foot-and-mouth disease and equine piroplasmosis in wild populations in a context of increasing agricultural intensification.

Raffaele Mattioli, DVM, PhD, is senior officer of disease ecology/noninfectious & production disease at the Food and Agriculture Organizations of the United Nations (FAO), Rome, Italy. He holds a PhD in tropical animal production at the Prince Leopold Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium. He has more than 16 years of working experience in Africa and more than 30 years of working experience with developing countries. In FAO Rome, his geographical regions of competence are the Middle East, Latin America and the Caribbean, and sub-Saharan Africa. Main activities range from livestock-agriculture policy development to integrating pest and animal health management. Mattioli is the author of more than 100 scientific publications in peer-reviewed scientific journals, book chapters, and international conference proceedings.

Claudia Pittiglio is an ecologist and a GIS expert in landscape ecology, species distribution modeling, risk mapping for animal diseases and human-wildlife conflicts, spatial analysis, and remote sensing. She holds a PhD in landscape ecology from the Faculty of Geo-Information Science and Earth Observation, University of Twente, in the Netherlands. Pittiglio currently works for the Animal Production and Health Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), in Rome, Italy. She has conducted modeling on crop raiding in elephants, poverty in Uganda, Rift Valley fever, and human-wildlife interfaces on sites across Africa.

About the Editors

Robert G. Wallace, PhD, is a public health phylogeographer presently visiting the University of Minnesota's Institute for Global Studies. His research has addressed the evolution and spread of influenza, the agro-economics of Ebola, the social geography of HIV/AIDS in New York City, the emergence of Kaposi's sarcoma herpesvirus out of Ugandan prehistory, and the evolution of infection life history in response to antivirals. Wallace is co-author of *Farming Human Pathogens: Ecological Resilience and Evolutionary Process* (Springer) and *Big Farms Make Big Flu: Dispatches on Infectious Disease, Agribusiness, and the Nature of Science* (Monthly Review Press). He has consulted for the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.

Rodrick Wallace, PhD, is a research scientist in the Division of Epidemiology of the New York State Psychiatric Institute at Columbia University. He received undergraduate and graduate degrees in mathematics and physics from Columbia, worked for a decade as a public interest lobbyist, is a past recipient of an Investigator Award in Health Policy Research from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, and is the author of numerous books and papers on matters of public health and public order.